1 2 3 4 5 6	GLENN ROTHNER (CSB No. 67353) MARIA KEEGAN MYERS (CSB No. 268033) DANIEL B. ROJAS (CSB No. 287802) ROTHNER, SEGALL & GREENSTONE 510 South Marengo Avenue Pasadena, California 91101 Telephone: (626) 796-7555 Facsimile: (626) 577-0124 E-mail: grothner@rsglabor.com	COMFORMED COPY ORIGINAL FILED County of Los Angeles SEP 18 2018 Shert R. Garter, executive Officer/Clerk By: Gloriella Rownson, Deputy	
7	Attorneys for Petitioner American Federation of Teachers		
8			
9	SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
10	COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES		
11		BS175171	
12	AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS,	CASE NO.	
13	Petitioner,		
14	v.	VERIFIED PETITION FOR WRIT OF	
15 16	LOS ANGELES UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT; BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE LOS ANGELES UNIFIED SCHOOL	MANDATE	
17	DISTRICT; AUSTIN BEUTNER, in his capacity as SUPERINTENDENT OF SCHOOLS FOR THE LOS ANGELES	[Gov't Code § 6258; Code Civ. Proc. § 1085]	
18	UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT,		
19	Respondents.		
20 21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
20		[

VERIFIED PETITION FOR WRIT OF MANDATE

INTRODUCTION

- 1. "The liberties of a people never were, nor ever will be, secure, when the transactions of their rulers may be concealed from them." Patrick Henry, Speech on the Federal Constitution, June 9, 1788. Petitioner American Federation of Teachers ("AFT" or "Petitioner") seeks to uncover the transactions of a public institution that serves 735,000 students by compelling respondents Los Angeles Unified School District ("LAUSD") and Austin Beutner, Superintendent of LAUSD (collectively "Respondents") to comply with their ministerial duties under the California Public Records Act ("CPRA"), Government Code § 6250 *et seq.*, and provide it with certain public records it requested.
- 2. The California Supreme Court recently emphasized the importance of the transparency facilitated by CPRA in *San Jose v. Superior Court* by stating: "[p]ublic access laws [like CPRA] serve a crucial function. Openness in government is essential to the functioning of a democracy. Implicit in the democratic process is the notion that government should be accountable for its actions. In order to verify accountability, individuals must have access to government files. Such access permits checks against the arbitrary exercise of official power and secrecy in the political process." (2017) 2 Cal. 5th 608, 615 (internal citations and quotation marks omitted).

PARTIES

- 3. Petitioner American Federation of Teachers ("AFT") is, and at all relevant times was, a labor organization that champions, on behalf of its members and students: fairness; democracy; economic opportunity; free and equal education as embodied in public schools; safe and sanitary working conditions; reasonable hours for reasonable pay; women's rights; and civil rights.
- 4. Respondent LAUSD is a public school district organized and operating under, and pursuant to, the laws of the State of California. LAUSD serves approximately 735,000 students and employs approximately 26,500 teachers and 33,500 other employees. It is the largest school

July 26, 2018 I'd appreciate it if you let me know whether the District intends to

28

///

respond to this request by Monday, August 27th. If I don't hear back from you by that date, I will have to assume that the district is denying my request. If the district needs more time to review the requested materials, I am more than willing to work with you on that."

- 11. By e-mail dated August 21, 2018, Sandoval responded to Murray: "My apologies for not responding to you earlier. Your request is definitely not denied. . . . I have a copy of the calendar requested, it is being reviewed by my supervising attorney, but we do need to obtain final approval from the [Superintendent]. I expect to have that by Monday and will continue to make every effort to get it to you asap."
- 12. By e-mail dated August 27, 2018, Sandoval further responded to Murray: "I'll be sending you the requested calendar on Tuesday, 8/28."
- 13. By e-mail dated September 6, 2018, Murray once again reminded Sandoval: "I still have not received these documents. Do you have any updated ETA for me?" Murray also called Sandoval on this date to receive an update about the status of the records request but was unable to reach her.
- 14. By e-mail dated September 7, 2018, Sandoval once again promised: "I'm making every effort to send this to you this afternoon. It has been approved by the [Superintendent's] office, but I need to obtain my immediate attorney's approval before sending it." A true and correct copy of the email thread containing the emails exchanged by Murray and Sandoval discussed in paragraphs 9-14 of this Petition is attached hereto as Exhibit C. On September 7, 2018, Murray called Sandoval once again to further discuss the status of the records request but was still unable to reach her.
- 15. By e-mail dated September 10, 2018, Sandoval revised her previous promises: "[w]e are still in the process of reviewing whether the Superintendent's calendar is a public record. At the present time, the Superintendent's calendar is not authorized for release to the public; I will not have a final answer until the middle of next week."

- 16. On September 10, 2018, Murray responded to Sandoval's email, stating in part: "If I don't receive responsive documents by COB Thursday [September 13], I will be forced to consider this request denied." A true and correct copy of the email correspondence exchanged between Murray and Sandoval described above in paragraphs 15-16 is attached hereto as Exhibit D.
- 17. To date, Respondents have failed to make available to Petitioner any of the requested records or to justify withholding any of these records from it.

PETITION FOR WRIT OF MANDATE

- 18. Petitioner AFT re-alleges and incorporates by reference each and every allegation contained in the previous paragraphs.
- 19. Government Code § 6253(b) provides in pertinent part: "Except with respect to public records exempt from disclosure by express provisions of law, each state or local agency, upon request for a copy of records that reasonably describes an identifiable record or records, shall make the records promptly available to any person upon payment of fees covering direct costs of duplication, or a statutory fee if applicable."
- 20. Government Code § 6255(a) provides that "[t]he agency shall justify withholding any record by demonstrating that the record in question is exempt under express provisions of this chapter or that on the facts of the particular case the public interest served by not disclosing the record clearly outweighs the public interest served by disclosure of the record."
- 21. Government Code § 6255(b) provides that "[a] response to a written request for inspection or copies of public records that includes a determination that the request is denied, in whole or in part, shall be in writing."
- 22. All of the requested records are public records within the meaning of CPRA and none of the requested records are exempt from disclosure.
- 23. By failing to make available to Petitioner cost estimates to provide the requested records, and by failing to make available to Petitioner any of the requested records or to justify

withholding any of these records from it, Respondents have failed to comply with their ministerial duties under Government Code §§ 6253(b) and 6255.

- 24. Government Code § 6258 provides that "[a]ny person may institute proceedings for injunctive or declarative relief or writ of mandate in any court of competent jurisdiction to enforce his or her right to inspect or to receive a copy of any public record or class of public records under this chapter."
- 25. Petitioner is entitled to a writ of mandate, pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure § 1085, because as described in ¶¶ 7-17 above Respondents violated their clear, present, and ministerial duty to make available to Petitioner any of the requested records or to justify withholding any of these records from it or, in the alternative, to notify it in writing of their decision to withhold any of the requested records and to justify that decision as provided by law.
- 26. Petitioner has no plain, speedy, or adequate remedy at law nor an administrative remedy it may exhaust with regard to the deprivation of its statutory rights described in this petition.
- 27. Government Code § 6259(d) provides in pertinent part that "[t]he court shall award court costs and reasonable attorney fees to plaintiff should plaintiff prevail in litigation filed pursuant to this section."

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Petitioner prays:

- 1. That this Court issue a writ of mandate commanding the Respondent, and each of them, immediately:
 - a. to disclose all records requested by Petitioner AFT in its California Public Records Act request;
 - b. alternatively, that the Court order respondent LAUSD to show cause why the requested records should not be disclosed;

1	2.	2. For court costs and reasonable attorneys' fees incurred herein; and	
2	3.	For such other and further relief as the Court deems just and proper.	
3			
4	DATED:	September 17, 2018 GLENN ROTHNER MARIA KEEGAN MYERS	
5		MARIA KEEGAN MYERS DANIEL B. ROJAS ROTINIER, SEGAT L & CREENSTONE	
6		ROTHNER, SEGALL & GREENSTONE	
7		By MARIA KEEGAN MYERS	
8		Attorneys for Petitioner American Federation of Teachers	
9		reactions	
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17		•	
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
	1	7	

VERIFICATION

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES

I am the Manager of Research and Strategic Initiatives for AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS, petitioner in this action. I am authorized to make this verification for and on behalf of AMERICAN FEDERATION OF TEACHERS and make this verification for that reason.

I have read the foregoing VERIFIED PETITION FOR WRIT OF MANDATE and know its contents. The matters stated in the foregoing VERIFIED PETITION FOR WRIT OF MANDATE are true to my own knowledge, except as to the matters which are therein stated upon information or belief, and as to those matters I believe them to be true.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed at Washington, D.C. this $\sqrt{7}$ day of September, 2018.

BRAD MURRAY

Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

From:

Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Sent:

Wednesday, July 11, 2018 7:44 AM

To:

pra@lausd.net

Subject:

Public Records Act request

Hello,

Please see the attached Public Records Act request. Feel free to contact me with any questions.

Thanks,

Brad

Attachments:

beutner FOIA.docx

(15 KB)

Brad Murray 555 New Jersey Ave NW Washington, DC 20001

July 7, 2018

Office of the General Counsel 333 S. Beaudry Avenue, 24th Fl. Los Angeles, CA 90017 via email: pra@lausd.net

Dear records officer:

Pursuant to California Public Records Act § 6250 et seq., I am requesting an electronic copy of the official calendar, inclusive of all attachments, for Austin Beutner. You may restrict this request to Mr. Beutner's calendar as kept for May 15th, 2018 through the date this request is processed.

This information is being requested on behalf of a non-profit organized under Section 501(c) of the Internal Revenue Code, and is not being sought for commercial purposes. If there are any fees for searching or copying these records, please inform me if the cost will exceed \$200.00.

The California Public Records Act requires a response within ten business days. If access to the records I am requesting will take longer, please contact me with information about when I might expect copies or the ability to inspect the requested records.

If you deny any or all of this request, please cite each specific exemption you feel justifies the refusal to release the information and notify me of the appeal procedures available to me under the law.

Thank you for considering my request.

Sincerely,

Brad Murray bmurray@aft.org

AUSTIN BEUTNERSuperintendent of Schools

DAVID HOLMQUISTGeneral Counsel

July 19, 2018

By Electronic Mail

Mr. Brad Murray
American Federation of Teachers
Email: bmurray@aft.org

Re: Public Records Act Request Dated July 7, 2018

Our File: OGC Control No. 0044251

Dear Mr. Murray:

This letter responds to your Public Records Act Request dated July 7, 2018, addressed to the Office of the General Counsel, Public Records Act Unit, requesting a copy of Superintendent Beutner's calendar from May 15, 2018 through the date your request is processed.

Your request has been reviewed. Pursuant to Government Code §6253(c), the District has made the determination that your request seeks public records and will produce these records to you, except for any material which is exempt from disclosure.

The District estimates documents subject to public disclosure will be provided to you on or before the close of business on July 26, 2018.

If you have any questions in the meantime, please contact me by email at maritza.sandoval@lausd.net or by calling me at (213) 241-3793.

Sincerely,

Maritza Sandoval

Maritza Sandoval Senior Paralegal

EXHIBIT "B" 11

Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

From:

Sandoval, Maritza <maritza.sandoval@lausd.net>

Sent:

Friday, September 07, 2018 2:53 PM

To:

Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Subject:

RE: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

I'm sorry, I'm making every effort to send this to you this afternoon. It has been approved by the Supt.'s office, but I need to obtain my immediate attorney's approval before sending it.

Maritza Sandoval, Senior Paralegal LAUSD, Office of the General Counsel 333 South Beaudry Avenue, 20th Floor Los Angeles, California 90017 Phone: (213) 241-3793

Phone: (213) 241-3793 Fax: (213) 241-8444

E-mail: maritza.sandoval@lausd.net

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

This message, together with any attachments, is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential, or exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message or any attachment is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete this message, along with any attachments, from your computer

From: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives [mailto:bmurray@aft.org]

Sent: Thursday, September 6, 2018 1:14 PM

To: Sandoval, Maritza < maritza.sandoval@lausd.net>

Subject: Re: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

Hi Maritza,

I still have not received these documents. Do you have any updated ETA for me?

Thanks,

Brad

From: Sandoval, Maritza < maritza.sandoval@lausd.net >

Sent: Monday, August 27, 2018 9:02 PM

To: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Subject: RE: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

I'll be sending you the requested calendar on Tuesday, 8/28.

Maritza Sandoval, Senior Paralegal LAUSD, Office of the General Counsel 333 South Beaudry Avenue, 20th Floor Los Angeles, California 90017 Phone: (213) 241-3793

Fax: (213) 241-8444

E-mail: maritza.sandoval@lausd.net

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

This message, together with any attachments, is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential, or exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message or any attachment is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete this message, along with any attachments, from your computer

From: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives [mailto:bmurray@aft.org]

Sent: Tuesday, August 21, 2018 8:52 AM

To: Sandoval, Maritza <maritza.sandoval@lausd.net>

Subject: RE: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

Thanks! Appreciate the response!

From: Sandoval, Maritza [mailto:maritza.sandoval@lausd.net]

Sent: Tuesday, August 21, 2018 11:51 AM

To: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Subject: RE: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

My apologies for not responding to you earlier. You request is definitely not denied. We have a possible teachers' strike with UTLA this week and besides numerous other matters, the Superintendent's office is quite busy attending to the UTLA strike.

I have a copy of the calendar requested, it is being reviewed by my supervising attorney, but we do need to obtain final approval from the Supt. I expect to have that by Monday and will continue to make every effort to get it to you asap.

Maritza Sandoval, Senior Paralegal LAUSD, Office of the General Counsel 333 South Beaudry Avenue, 20th Floor Los Angeles, California 90017

Phone: (213) 241-3793 Fax: (213) 241-8444

E-mail: maritza.sandoval@lausd.net

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

This message, together with any attachments, is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential, or exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message or any attachment is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete this message, along with any attachments, from your computer

From: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives [mailto:bmurray@aft.org]

Sent: Tuesday, August 21, 2018 8:40 AM

To: Sandoval, Maritza < maritza.sandoval@lausd.net >

Subject: RE: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

Hi Maritza,

Your initial correspondence indicated that you'd be remitting responsive documents by July 26, 2018. I have not yet received these documents, nor have I heard back from you.

I know this a super busy time of the year, but I'd appreciate it if you could let me know whether the District intends to respond to this request by Monday, August 27th. If I don't hear back from you by that date, I will have to assume that

the district is denying my request. If the district needs more time to review the requested materials, I am more than willing to work with you on that. Please just let me know!

Thanks,

Brad

From: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Sent: Friday, August 17, 2018 9:41 AM

To: 'Sandoval, Maritza'

Subject: RE: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

Hi,

Just writing to check on the progress of this PRA request.

Thanks,

Brad

From: Sandoval, Maritza [mailto:maritza.sandoval@lausd.net]

Sent: Thursday, July 19, 2018 3:17 PM

To: Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Subject: LAUSD Supt. Beutner's Calendar Request - OGC Control No. 0044251

In response to your Public Records Act Request, see attached correspondence.

Maritza Sandoval, Senior Paralegal LAUSD, Office of the General Counsel 333 South Beaudry Avenue, 20th Floor Los Angeles, California 90017 Phone: (213) 241-3793

Fax: (213) 241-8444

E-mail: maritza.sandoval@lausd.net

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

This message, together with any attachments, is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential, or exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message or any attachment is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete this message, along with any attachments, from your computer

This e-mail and any attachments are confidential and are intended solely for the named addressee(s). If you are not a named addressee, you should not copy, after, post, forward, distribute or disseminate the contents of the e-mail or attachments. When responding, please refrain from including information such as social security numbers, passwords, and other sensitive types of data in non-encrypted emails and non-password protected email attachments. Any views or opinions expressed are solely those of the Individual and do not necessarily represent those of the American Federation of Teachers (AFT).

Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

From:

Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Sent:

Monday, September 10, 2018 11:40 AM

To:

'Sandoval, Maritza'

Subject:

RE: Request for Superintendent's Calendar - OGC Control No. 0044251

I'm really losing my patience here. I'm sure someone above you is playing political games here, and I'm sorry, Maritza, that you're being put in this intermediary position.

The superintendent's calendar is <u>plainly a public record</u>. I'm confused about why, if such a fundamental issue was ever in dispute, you would give me multiple specific deadlines for when I should expect the release of this information. Why should I trust that you'll be releasing this by the "middle of the week" when you've blown way past your statutory deadline and two prior self-imposed deadlines?

I don't want to litigate this, because when we undoubtedly prevail and LAUSD is forced to to pay attorney's fees those will be dollars that should have gone to the classroom. But I'm starting to think that you're just stringing me along, and such measures will be necessary to get LAUSD to comply with basic transparency measures under California law.

If I don't have responsive documents by COB Thursday, I will be forced to consider this request denied.

From: Sandoval, Maritza [mailto:maritza.sandoval@lausd.net]

Sent: Monday, September 10, 2018 11:25 AM **To:** Bradford Murray, Research & Strategic Initiatives

Subject: Request for Superintendent's Calendar - OGC Control No. 0044251

Dear Mr. Murray:

We are still in the process of reviewing whether the Superintendent's calendar is a public record. At the present time, the Superintendent's calendar is not authorized for release to the public; I will not have a final answer until the middle of next week.

Maritza Sandoval, Senior Paralegal LAUSD, Office of the General Counsel 333 South Beaudry Avenue, 20th Floor Los Angeles, California 90017

Phone: (213) 241-3793 Fax: (213) 241-8444

E-mail: maritza.sandoval@lausd.net

Please consider the environment before printing this e-mail

This message, together with any attachments, is intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which it is addressed and may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential, or exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient; you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message or any attachment is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender immediately by telephone or by return e-mail and delete this message, along with any attachments, from your computer